



ADVISORY COUNCIL PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

VICTOR TORREANO, CHAIRPERSON CASSANDRA ADAMS ELINOR BLAKE JEFFREY BRAMLETT LINDA WEINER

MONDAY AUGUST 15, 2005 1:30 P.M. **CONFERENCE ROOM 716**

AGENDA

- 1. Call to Order Roll Call
- 2. Public Comment Period

Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3. The public has the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for Advisory Council Committee meetings are posted at the District, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, at least 72 hours before a meeting. At the beginning of the meeting, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Committee's purview. Speakers are limited to five minutes each.

- 3. Approval of Minutes of June 13, 2005
- 4. Continued Discussion of Recommendations Regarding the District's Role in Indoor Air Quality Management

The Committee will continue its review of information on indoor air quality received in presentations from the staff of the California Department of Health Services, Environmental Protection Agency Region IX, and the California Air Resources Board, and discuss and possibly propose recommendations on the District's role in indoor air quality management for review by the full Advisory Council.

5. Committee Member Comments/Other Business

Committee or staff members on their own initiative, or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on their own activities, provide a reference to staff about factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning a matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda.

6. Time and Place of Next Meeting

1:30 p.m., Monday, October 17, 2005, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109.

7. Adjournment

VT:jc

CONTACT CLERK OF THE BOARDS - 939 ELLIS STREET SF, CA 94109

(415) 749-4965 FAX: (415) 928-8560 BAAQMD homepage: www.baaqmd.gov

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- To request special accommodations for those persons with disabilities notification to the Clerk's Office should be given in a timely manner so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109

(415) 771-6000

CLERK OF THE BOARDS OFFICE: MONTHLY CALENDAR OF DISTRICT MEETINGS

AUGUST 2005

TYPE OF MEETING	DAY	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Advisory Council Air Quality Planning Committee - CANCELLED	Wednesday	10	9:30 a.m.	Room 716
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets 2 nd Thursday each Month) - CANCELLED	Thursday	11	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Advisory Council Public Health Committee	Monday	15	1:30 p.m.	Room 716
Advisory Council Joint Technical & Air Quality Planning Committee	Tuesday	16	10:00 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month) - CANCELLED	Wednesday	17	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Joint Policy Committee - CANCELLED	Friday	19	10:00 a.m. – Noon	MetroCenter Auditorium 101 8 th Street Oakland, CA 94607
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee (Meets 4 th Wednesday each Month) - CANCELLED	Wednesday	24	9:45 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee (Meets at the call of the Chair) - CANCELLED	Wednesday	31	9:30	4 th Floor Conf. Room

SEPTEMBER 2005

TYPE OF MEETING	DAY	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month) - CANCELLED	Wednesday	7	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets 2 nd Thursday each Month)	Thursday	8	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Public Outreach Committee (Meets 4th Monday every other month) - RESCHEDULED TO 10/24/05	Monday	12	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Advisory Council	Wednesday	14	9:00 a.m.	Room 716

Executive Committee

September 2005 Calendar continued on next page

SEPTEMBER 2005

TYPE OF MEETING	<u>DAY</u>	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Advisory Council Regular Meeting	Wednesday	14	10:00 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee (Meets at the call of the Chair)	Thursday	15	9:45 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	21	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Joint Policy Committee	Friday	23	10:00 a.m. – Noon	MetroCenter Auditorium 101 8 th Street Oakland, CA 94607
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee (Meets 4 th Monday every other Month)	Monday	26	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee (Meets 4th Wednesday each Month)	Wednesday	28	9:45 a.m.	4th Floor Conf. Room

OCTOBER 2005

TYPE OF MEETING	<u>DAY</u>	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets I^{st} & 3^{rd} Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	5	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Advisory Council Air Quality Planning Committee	Wednesday	12	9:30 a.m.	Room 716
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets 2 nd Thursday each Month)	Thursday	13	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Advisory Council Public Health Committee	Monday	17	1:30 p.m.	Room 716
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	19	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Joint Policy Committee	Friday	21	10:00 a.m. – Noon	MetroCenter Auditorium 101 8 th Street Oakland, CA 94607
Board of Directors Public Outreach Committee (Meets 4th Monday every other month)	Monday	24	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee (Meets 4th Wednesday each Month)	Wednesday	26	9:45 a.m.	4th Floor Conf. Room

MR:hl 8/4/05 (11:00 a.m.) P/Library/Calendar/Moncal

Bay Area Air Quality Management District 939 Ellis Street San Francisco, California 94109

DRAFT MINUTES

Advisory Council Public Health Committee Meeting 1:30 p.m., Tuesday, June 13, 2005

- 1. Call to Order Roll Call. Chairperson Torreano called the meeting to order at 1:37 p.m. <u>Present</u>: Victor Torreano, Chairperson, Elinor Blake, Jeffrey Bramlett, Linda Weiner. <u>Absent</u>: Cassandra Adams.
- **2. Public Comment Period.** There were no public comments.
- **3. Approval of Minutes of April 18, 2005.** Chairperson Torreano moved approval of the minutes; seconded by Mr. Bramlett; carried unanimously.
- **4.** Discussion of Recommendations Regarding the District's Role in Indoor Air Quality (IAQ) Management. Chairperson Torreano briefly reviewed the chronology of the Committee's discussion on IAQ and distributed his memorandum entitled "Air District's Role in Indoor Air Quality (IAQ)" dated June 13, 2005. It set forth the following:
 - A. The District develops a relationship with applicable crafts through State Registered training facilities where registered apprentices and service technicians:
 - are trained to assist schools and homeowners to perform District approved IAQ assessment when on site for "best practice" in repair, maintenance or construction of building systems.
 - Are educated to the health risks related to poor indoor air quality and their role in identifying, reducing and removing indoor contaminant sources and emissions.
 - Work from a District endorsed standard for the commissioning of mechanical system in schools and homes. Approach school districts on developing and requiring new building practice and requiring new building commissioning and retro commissioning.
 - B. Have the Air District publicly endorse a list of acceptable and unacceptable portable indoor air cleaners/filters.
 - C. Concentrate on homes and schools for "high priority, high benefit" action.
 - D. Form a summit/workshop with university/industry researchers to legislatively develop IAQ standards and regulations through state and local government. Addressing product labeling requirements with manufacturers held responsible to test products and publish the data on labels.
 - E. Partner with labor organizations and management associations to create a viable supply source of certified contractors and technicians for school districts and housing authorities to measure CO, CO2, radon, ozone, VOC and airborne particulates.

In discussion of the foregoing memorandum, the following comments were raised:

Pending Legislation

- Pending state legislation would provide the California Air Resources Board (CARB) with more authority over IAQ. Efforts to regulate IAQ were made by CARB and several air districts in the 1980s but were successfully opposed by the business community. The District has a brochure on radon, but it has not adopted a program on IAQ. (Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy APCO) Were California to adopt an IAQ program, the District could move forward with an IAQ program that would supplement a state's program. (Peter Hess, Deputy APCO)
- The Committee should hear about the state legislation that is currently proposed and avoid recommendations that go ahead of the proposed bills, especially if home servicing or home ownership standards are being contemplated in the legislation. (Bramlett)

Committee Recommendations from 2004

- Recommendations from 2004 should be combined with those that are adopted today. (Weiner)
- The Committee's previous recommendation that the District hire a graduate student to work on IAQ issues was intended primarily to establish a liaison with academic researchers. (Blake)
- The Committee's previous recommendation that the District hold an IAQ workshop can also be used as a survey tool of community needs as well as a forum within which to obtain and discuss ideas. (Weiner) Information from future meetings should be combined with data gathered at previous community meetings which were the context from which this referral to the Council originated. The extent to which state and local health departments and CARB have already gathered such information should be assessed to avoid duplicating completed surveys. (Blake)

Regulatory Jurisdiction and Available Information

- The District has jurisdiction over exposure to outdoor air but people spend nearly 90% of their time indoors. Since the District has received numerous questions on IAQ from the public at community meetings, the issue concerns whether the District should respond and, if so, in what manner. The District should improve its ability to redirect or refer questions to the agencies that have set pieces of this issue and also be prepared to answer such questions. (Bramlett) The District does refer some questions to other agencies but also has IAQ information available that could be added to a larger mission statement. (Roggenkamp)
- The American Lung Association (ALA), Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), and the State Health Service Department (SHSD) have developed considerable information on IAQ, which could be imprinted with the District's logo and be distributed by the District.
- Effective development of educational materials could be achieved by gathering leads from target audience, and addressing specific areas for action, and examining additional channels of dissemination beyond the more standard public workshops. (Weiner)

Focusing on IAQ in Residences

- Residential IAQ assessment at the time of appliance change-out or retrofit by a technician mirrors a PG&E energy audit. The deeper question is how to make IAQ a priority in a residence. (Roggenkamp) The graduate student recommended by the Council could develop the informational materials on how individual citizens affect IAQ in the home. (Bramlett)
- District inspectors can inspect facilities with operating permits and conduct odor nuisance abatement visits at residences, but they may not inspect homes for IAQ. (Roggenkamp)

- Owners of larger buildings might be concerned over liability for sick building syndrome. Therefore, residences are a better starting point from which to address IAQ. At the time homes are repaired or modified, a technician could conduct an IAQ assessment. A list of things that the homeowner or resident would look out for could be provided by the District to renters, homeowners, and the various trades crafts. Union locals could have IAQ training as part of their apprenticeship training, and this could be applied to any contractor who wants training. Addressing the larger building facilities would be a next step in the IAQ process. (Torreano)
- The District's role in IAQ must be defined before home assessment can be recommended. It is unclear that homeowners could afford such assessments. (Blake, Weiner)
- EPA provides an extensive check list in its informational materials. (Bramlett) Then it is more of a distribution issue, and dissemination issue at the time of repair or retrofit. (Torreano) The type of asthma programs administered by local health departments would have to first be assessed and local planning departments accessed for residential permit data. At this point information could be provided to homes and also advertise the District. (Blake)

Focusing on Schools

- The District does conduct public outreach on air quality in general to students in schools. Barbara Spark of EPA indicated California has taken up the "Tools for Schools" program less robustly than other states. (Roggenkamp)
- The ALA "Open Airways for Schools" teaches about asthma in schools. Educational materials were developed in an incremental manner, starting with small, doable steps. The same could be distributed to home owners, renters, and environmental justice groups. (Weiner)

Future Focus on Collaboration with Labor Crafts

- The District could collaborate with applicable labor crafts to ensure consistent training and testing of indoor environments. A technician could volunteer to assess the home for appliance efficacy, pesticide and chemical use indoors and walk through the home. (Torreano)
- Hard copy materials could be developed for distribution, addressing how District programs influence IAQ, thus initiating the documentation and distribution process. Distribution should begin through local channels and work outward toward unions and other groups. (Bramlett)
- Training the trades' technicians in the field of IAQ and providing them with information from the District, ALA, CARB and EPA's check list is a potentially fruitful idea for long-term, future development, but this entails a massive program beyond the District's present capability. The extent to which such associations would like to become distributors of such information should be ascertained, and if they would like to do so, they should be encouraged. (Blake)
- Trades craft training involves approximately two evenings a week with a five-year program, and IAQ could be incorporated into the curriculum. A pilot program targeted only toward specific locals cannot be considered because such training should be consistent throughout all the locals of the Central Labor Councils. (Torreano)

- Interview health department staff that operate asthma programs and also check in with planning departments and ascertain if the District could supply something that is missing. (Blake)
- There are large mailing lists for community forums. A lot of information has already been gathered by the District and other agencies on IAQ and the District should evaluate recent material to make sure there is no duplication. Such meetings should reach more than the traditional attendees with which the District has had a long-standing relationship. (Blake)

The Committee reached consensus that the District's IAQ focus should initially be on residences, followed by schools. It should involve developing materials on IAQ awareness that identify the issues of concern, sources of available information, and accesses a larger distribution network. Both the EPA and ALA have considerable IAQ information for schools and it is best to refer others to such information. However, there are academic studies on IAQ to which additional reference would need to be made in the District's IAQ awareness documentation. Representatives from CARB, EPA and the SHSD all strongly suggested the District disseminate information on IAQ.

Regarding the issue of ozone-generating residential air cleaners, CARB indicated this is an issue of false advertising and the state Attorney General is investigating the matter. However, the Council could consider recommending the District indicate that its ambient program aims to reduce ozone, and that residents that add ozone to the indoor home environment refute the District's efforts.

- **5.** Committee Member Comments/Other Business. There was none.
- **6. Time and Place of Next Meeting.** 1:30 p.m., Monday, August 15, 2005, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.
- 7. Adjournment. 3:03 p.m.

James N. Corazza Deputy Clerk of the Boards

Bay Area Air Quality Management District 939 Ellis Street San Francisco, California 94109

August 8, 2005

To: Chairperson Zamora and Members of the Advisory Council

From: Chairperson Torreano and Members of the Public Health Committee

Subject: Air District Role in Indoor Air Quality (IAQ)

Topic: The District's role in Indoor Air Quality (IAQ) management.

Pollution indoors is generated both from within buildings, and from the air outside. However, there is no systematic program in the state to address IAQ, and there are few regulations and standards that address IAQ problems. The District has a unique opportunity to consider its role in IAQ, and District staff have asked the Advisory Council to consider the matter and make recommendations.

Background

In 2004, the Council considered the District's role in IAQ. The Public Health Committee took the lead and presented two recommendations which were discussed and adopted by the Council. These were later presented to the Board of Directors Executive Committee which accepted the Council's report.

At the outset of 2005, District staff requested the Council to further review the District's role in IAQ, and the Advisory Council incorporated this topic into its work plan for 2005. Over the last two years, both the Public Health Committee and Council received guest speaker presentations on IAQ with the aim of obtaining a broad perspective on the topic.

The Public Health Committee and Advisory Council held the following meetings at which the subject of IAQ was discussed:

- (a) Regular Meeting, May 12, 2004, Guest Speaker: Jed Waldman, Cal. Dept. Health Services.
- (b) Public Health Committee Meeting, August 9, 2004 deliberation of draft recommendations.
- (c) Regular Meeting, September 8, 2004 adoption of Committee recommendations on IAQ.
- (d) Regular Meeting, January 12, 2005 placement of IAQ on the Council's work plan for 2005
- (e) Public Health Committee Meeting, February 15, 2005, Guest Speaker: Barbara Spark, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region IX, on IAQ from the federal perspective.
- (f) Public Health Committee Meeting, April 18, 2005, Guest Speaker: Peggy Jenkins, California Air Resources Board, on IAQ from the state perspective.
- (g) Public Health Committee Meeting, June 13, 2005 deliberations on draft recommendations
- (h) Public Health Committee Meeting, August 15, 2005

Recommendations from 2004:

(1) Regional IAQ Workshop. The District convene or initiate a workshop or series of workshops, or summit, within the next year in which government agencies, researchers, and organizations concerned with IAQ can discuss the current and potential roles of the District and others in improving IAQ. Included among the issues to be addressed should be building materials and their appropriate installation and maintenance. These workshops might be convened as statewide, involving other air districts, or as Bay Area workshops with state agency representation. Such workshop(s) would provide a forum for the generation and exchange of ideas and information to develop District proposals and programs for a cohesive approach to IAQ.

Elaboration of above recommendation in 2005: The workshops should be used as a survey tool of community needs as well as a forum within which to obtain and discuss ideas. Information from future meetings should be combined with data gathered at previous community meetings which were the context from which this referral to the Council originated. While there are large mailing lists for community forums, such meetings should reach more than the traditional attendees with which the District has had a long-standing relationship.

(2) <u>Graduate Student Investigator</u>. The District should consider establishing a graduate student investigator initiative to research impacts of regional air pollution on indoor environments. The Bay Area has an impressive number of universities that conduct research on IAQ: this initiative would allow the District to tap into those resources at relatively little cost, with the added benefit of providing recognition to the District. CARB, CDHS and other agency experts could also be mentors. The District could administer the program or arrange with another entity to do so (e.g., a non-profit such as the Public Health Institute; a university President's Office; a Bay Area foundation). Students would apply annually for the funds, and a review committee would select among the proposals. The California Interagency Working Group on IAQ, in which the District participates, could assist by suggesting potential IAQ-related research topics.

Recommendations from 2005:

- (1) <u>Track Pending State Legislation</u>. Pending state legislation would provide the California Air Resources Board (CARB) with more authority over IAQ. Were California to adopt an IAQ program, the District could move forward with an IAQ program that would supplement a state's program. The Committee should hear about the state legislation that is currently proposed and avoid making any recommendations that go ahead of the proposed bills.
- (2) The District should disseminate information on IAQ. Representatives from CARB, EPA and the SHSD all strongly suggested the District disseminate information on IAQ. The initial focus should be on residences, followed by schools. It should involve the development of materials on IAQ awareness that identify the issues of concern, sources of available information, and accesses a larger distribution network.
 - (a) Development of General Information.
 - (1) The American Lung Association (ALA), Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), and the State Health Service Department (SHSD) have developed considerable information on IAQ, which could be imprinted with the District's logo and be distributed by the District.

- (2) The District should improve its ability to redirect or refer questions to the agencies that have set pieces of this issue and also be prepared to answer such questions where appropriate. Development of educational materials can be achieved by gathering leads from target audience, and addressing specific areas for action, and examining additional channels of dissemination beyond workshops, etc.
- (3) Academic studies on IAQ to which additional reference can be made should be included in the District's IAQ awareness documentation.

(b) Information for Residences.

- (1) Homeowner/Renter Information. The District should assemble or prepare written documentation identifying IAQ items that homeowners and renters should look out for. These materials may be culled from existing texts developed by the EPA, ARB and ALA and other agencies and presented to homeowners and renters at the time of home repair or modification by the technicians performing the work.
- (2) Development of such informational materials could be modeled after the incrementtal manner in which the ALA "Open Airways for Schools" materials were developed. Much information has already been gathered by the District and other agencies on IAQ. Recent material should be evaluated to avoid duplication.

(c) Information for Schools.

- (1) Both the EPA and ALA have considerable IAQ information devoted specifically to schools to which inquirers may be referred for further information. The EPA's "Tools for Schools" and ALA's "Open Airways for Schools" are of special note.
- (2) The District does conduct public outreach on air quality in general to students in schools. The EPA and ALA materials, as well as other applicable information, could be included as part of the District's information distribution approach.

(d) Possible Future Collaboration with Labor Crafts

- (1) Residential Assessment. Once the District's role in IAQ is determined, it may consider a future area of activity through collaboration with local labor crafts for "residential IAQ assessment" at the time that homes are repaired or modified. A technician would volunteer to conduct an assessment of a home for IAQ issues. This would be similar to the energy audit conducted by PG&E. The affordability of assessments would have to be clarified. Hard copy materials for distribution to homeowners could be developed, addressing how District programs influence IAQ, thus initiating the documentation and distribution process. Distribution should begin through local channels and work outward toward unions and other groups. Addressing the larger building facilities would be a next step in the IAQ process.
- (2) Trades Training. Training the various crafts and technicians in the field of IAQ and providing them with information from the District, ALA, CARB and EPA's check list is a potentially fruitful idea for long-term, future development, but this entails a massive program beyond the District's present capability. The extent to which such associations would like to become distributors of such information should be ascertained, and if they would like to do so, they should be encouraged.